



# Minutes of Pre-Bid Meeting held at PC hotel

## Karachi

<u>Questions/Queries/Comments by Prospective Bidders</u>	<u>Answers/Response by the Procuring Agency</u>
<p><b><u>Progressive Education Network</u></b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The RFP requires CVs of key professional staff? How is it possible for a bidder to hire professional staff for the project which is competitive based nature and bidder doesn't know whether he/she would win the bid?</li> <li>2. What would be required for bidders to do if a person whom CV was submitted, might not be able to join the project?</li> <li>3. The RFP also encourages bidders to physically visit the schools and verify the data on which bidding proposal might be prepared. It would be difficult for interested bidders to visit the schools in the month of Ramzan while summer vacation are being observed. It is, therefore, requested to extend time of submission of proposals so that interested bidders have sufficient time to prepare a good and feasible bid.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. It is a common practice, nationally and internationally, to seek commitments from the competent and professional staff for the project and their CVs, after getting their consent, are submitted with the proposal. Sometimes, the bidders shared the CVs of their current staff to allocate their services for the project. It is, therefore, bidders' choice between seeking commitments or hiring/allocating services of key staff as deems appropriate to them. The procuring agency should have the right to know the experience, exposure and qualification of the staff who would run the project. This is an integral part of 'Value for Money' concept in public procurement.</li> <li>2. If a bidder wins the competitive bid, but might not be able to hire the person whom CV was shared in the winning bid, the bidder must hire the personnel having same qualification, skills and experience as mentioned in the CV submitted of that particular person.</li> <li>3. The request has been recorded for consideration. If there is any change in bid submission date, it would be announced publically.</li> </ol>
<p><b><u>Sargodhian Spirit Trust (SST)</u></b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. The EMO reform under PPP mode seems a good initiative of Sindh Education and Literacy Department (SELD). The SST is considering to participate in the bidding competition. But, time is very short to visit the schools and prepare the bid. It would be better if time of bid submission may be extended.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>4. The request has been recorded for consideration. If there is any change in bid submission date, it would be announced publically.</li> </ol>
<p><b><u>READ Foundation</u></b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5. The READ Foundation also requests for extension of bid submission date due to Ramzan and summer vacation in the schools.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5. The request has been recorded for consideration. If there is any change in bid submission date, it would be announced publically.</li> </ol>



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH**  
**SCHOOL EDUCATION AND LITERACY DEPARTMENT**  
**Karachi, Dated 9 May, 2019**

<p>6. Presentation for Pre-bid meeting is very helpful, it should be shared with all organizations.</p>	<p>6. The presentation has been extracted from RFP document. The bidders should follow the instructions as given in RFP document. However, the request has been recorded for consideration. If the SPPRA allows to do the same, the presentation would be uploaded publically with a disclaimer that any discrepancy found between RFP document and the ppt, the RFP document will prevail.</p>
<p><b><u>Charter for Compassion (CFC)</u></b></p> <p>7. CFC also endorses the demand of prospective bidders to extend date of submission of the bids.</p> <p>8. In the draft Concession Agreement, there is a need to consider for some Key Performance Indicators (KPIs). For example, the period for EMIS indicator is less to deliver effectively, it should be enhanced.</p> <p>9. Under KPI relation to training of teaching and non-teaching staff, progression of teaching staff performance has been elaborated, but progression of non-teaching staff is not clearly described. What government's expectation are to improve performance of non-teaching staff?</p> <p>10. Under district package of current procurement, there are cluster schools which have less facilities in comparison to newly reconstructed schools. It is suggested that there should be two types of KPIs for both types of the schools.</p> <p>11. Cost of Independent Expert and Independent Auditor is part of financial proposal which increases the cost of bidders' financial bids. It might be helpful for bidders if this cost is separated from financial bid.</p>	<p>7. The request has been recorded for consideration. If there is any change in bid submission date, it would be announced publically.</p> <p>8. The period for EMIS indicator is given 180 days which is sufficient time and also this duration was fixed after a consultative process of stakeholders. Therefore, this indicator may be remained as unchanged.</p> <p>9. The government expects to improve non-teaching staff performance professionally so that they should deliver their duties according to their job requirement. The explicit explanation of the indicator relating to non-teaching staff has already been given in the draft concession agreement. Please see last paragraph of "Notes/Guidelines of Professional Development Staff". It is also reproduced hereby for further perusal; <i>"Training of non-teaching staff, based on TNA, including administration and management relevant areas/SOW in day to day business of schools along with behavioural characteristics, language skills, IT, office decorum, etc."</i></p> <p>10. The purpose of inclusion of neighbouring schools as grouped ones with newly reconstructed schools is to benefit the children of surrounding areas with same intervention as the children of newly constructed schools have. The yearly benchmark of KPIs for soft components; i.e. increase in enrolment and learning outcomes have been fixed with comparatively lower targets.</p> <p>11. Cost of Independent Expert and Independent Auditor as part of financial proposal is in accordance with SPPRA rules under its PPP chapter. Therefore, bidders must prepare its financial bids by including cost of IE and IA at given proportionate.</p>



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH**  
**SCHOOL EDUCATION AND LITERACY DEPARTMENT**  
Karachi, Dated 9 May, 2019

<p><b><u>Management and Development Center (MDC)</u></b></p> <p>12. Is there any limitation to constitute a consortium i.e. 2 or 3 or more organizations can constitute a consortium?</p> <p>13. Can an EMO sub-contract any activity under Concession agreement?</p> <p>14. In RFP document, eligibility criteria for experience is given in general terms, not mentioning number of schools, while evaluation criteria entails minimum 5 schools/educational institutions with experience of minimum 5 years. Both statements should reflect same criterion.</p> <p>15. RFP document shows school status as proposed upgraded schools, what should bidder prepare its bids for current status or proposed level?</p> <p>16. Some KPIs are not observed in each quarter. How the marking of KPIs would be done in absence of specific KPIs?</p> <p>17. MDC would also request for extension in bid submission date.</p>	<p>12. There is no limitation of number organization to constitute a consortium, provided that all conditions for consortium are fulfilled and organizations have required eligibility criteria for the bid.</p> <p>13. EMO cannot sub-contract an activity under Concession Agreement.</p> <p>14. The observations has been considered and will be dealt accordingly. If SPPRA Rules allows, an amended version with more explicitly of criteria will be shared publically.</p> <p>15. The bidders are required to submit their bids on proposed level of schools' data.</p> <p>16. The KPIs are evaluated on basis of weightage scale, not on number scale. Therefore, the weightage is taken as 100 in each quarter.</p> <p>17. The request has been recorded for consideration. If there is any change in bid submission date, it would be announced publically.</p>
<p><b><u>Agency for Technical Cooperation and Development (ACTED)</u></b></p> <p>18. ACTED would also request for extension in bid submission date.</p> <p>19. After visit of several schools, it seems that construction of the schools may take another 5-6 months. How those schools will be handed over to EMOs?</p> <p>20. There are some schools with two rooms and huge enrolment. How an EMO may manage these schools without compromising quality?</p> <p>21. RFP document requires to introduce co-education in schools while it seems not possible in some of the areas.</p>	<p>18. The request has been recorded for consideration. If there is any change in bid submission date, it would be announced publically.</p> <p>19. The schools will be handed over to EMOs after completion of construction work along with provision of furniture in newly reconstructed schools.</p> <p>20. The bidders may use its expertise in managing student enrolment at optimum level and how bidder will share proposed resources and strategies to address these challenges with desired improved governance, access and quality of education in these schools.</p> <p>21. For mix gender schooling, community consent and follow the local cultural norms are necessary.</p>



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH**  
**SCHOOL EDUCATION AND LITERACY DEPARTMENT**  
**Karachi, Dated 9 May, 2019**

<b>HANDS</b>	
<p>22. What expectation of government are to improve access, governance and quality in grouped schools where learning facilities are comparatively less to the newly reconstructed schools? If a bidder proposes transportation for bringing students to newly constructed school for their higher education, the cost goes much higher and bidders may avoid to introduce these kinds of interventions.</p> <p>23. The condition of grouped schools is not satisfactory. Whether a bidder may propose an additional room or renovation to lift up the school standard? What if one bidder suggests this type of intervention and other not, how it would be a fair competition vis-à-vis apple to apple comparison?</p>	<p>22. Government has included grouped schools which are already selected as high priority schools. These schools are comparatively high enrolment schools. The distance of these selected schools from newly reconstructed school is maximum three kilometers; it means a reasonable access is offered to the students to get their higher education in the newly constructed school as maximum 3 kilometers away. The community outreach strategies of bidders may help to bring these students in schools for their higher education. The bidder can propose an innovative idea to provide these students access to quality education without high financial impact. This is where PPP and SPPRA work for VfM.</p> <p>23. The grouped schools have been selected amongst list of high priority schools of the government. The renovation work for making them a proper schools for 5 classes will be done by the government. Therefore, bidders have been asked in RFP not to include any capital cost in relation to construction/infrastructure work. Only minor repair and maintenance work may be proposed in budget/financial proposal as per guidelines given in financial model of the RFP. Therefore, a same scale and pitch has been provided for all bidders for a fair competition.</p>
<p>24. The Power of Attorney format is given in the RFP. If an organization intends to apply for the bids, is it necessary to get fresh approval of a Board Resolution for this project or the old Board Resolution is also acceptable, as it is difficult for some organizations who hold Board meetings at specific intervals that might be fall in bidding period?</p> <p>25. The Bid Security is 1% of the total project cost, is this the ratio of the project of the cost of 10 years or on basis of one year cost? If this ratio is at 10 years project cost, then it would go on higher side. The ratio of Bid Security should be fixed on lower side.</p> <p>26. In Annex XII of the SBEP EMO USAID Draft Concession Agreement, "As per Actual" reflect that inflation shall be charged at the Consumer</p>	<p>24. It is recommended to get fresh approval of the Board Resolution, but if there is a situation as stated in the question, Power of Attorney issued earlier to the bidding period may be submitted, the procuring agency may have the right to demand fresh approval of the resolution from the Board.</p> <p>25. The Bid Security is fixed in SPPRA Rules and cannot be changed. Further, the Bid Security is provided at final project cost (10 years cost in this case).</p> <p>26. The Annex-XII of the Concession Agreement, is to be linked to the cap of maximum 10 percent of inflation rate as provided in the guidelines of the financial model of RFP#5, and "as per actual" is to be deleted from Annex-XII accordingly.</p>



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH**  
**SCHOOL EDUCATION AND LITERACY DEPARTMENT**  
**Karachi, Dated 9 May, 2019**

Price Index of the particular year on the budget proposed by the Operator at the bidding stage.	
---	--

